Aspects of training that meet Indigenous Australians’ aspirations: A systematic review of research—Support document

CYDDE MILLER
LEA-ANN HARRIS

This document was produced by the authors based on their research for the report Aspects of training that meet Indigenous Australians’ aspirations: A systematic review of research, and is an added resource for further information. The report is available on NCVER’s website: <http://www.ncver.edu.au>

The views and opinions expressed in this document are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Australian Government, state and territory governments or NCVER. Any errors and omissions are the responsibility of the author(s).

© Australian Government, 2005

This work has been produced by the National Centre for Vocational Education Research (NCVER) on behalf of the Australian Government and state and territory governments with funding provided through the Australian Department of Education, Science and Training. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this publication may be reproduced by any process without written permission. Requests should be made to NCVER.
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resource</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Resources used for searching</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key search terms</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation template</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Resources used for searching

The systematic searching for relevant literature was undertaken in May and June 2004. Other resources were added later in 2004 as material became available.

Electronic online databases searched
Various bibliographic databases identified and searched via IlanetWeb http://www.ilanet.net.au
Indigenous Australia databases via Informit Online:
AEI-ATSIS; AIATSIS; FAMILY-ATSIS; APAIS-ATSIS
Education Abstracts (via database vendor – Dialog)
ERIC (via database vendor – Dialog)
Australian Education Index (AEI) cdrom + online via Informit Online
British Education Index (BEI) cdrom

Web based databases searched
VOCED http://www.voced.edu.au
Educational Research Abstracts (ERA) online http://www.tandf.co.uk/era

Web search engines used
Google http://www.google.com
Yahoo search http://search.yahoo.com
Dogpile http://www.dogpile.com

Websites viewed
Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander studies-internet guide http://www.library.cqu.edu.au/faculty/arts/aboriginal.htm
ABORIGINAL HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY (AHRDS) http://www17.hrdc-drhc.gc.ca/
Aboriginal Languages of Australia http://www.dnathan.com/VL/austLang.htm
Aboriginal Studies WWW Virtual Library http://www.ciolek.com/WWWVL-Aboriginal.html
Alaska Native Knowledge Network http://www.ankn.uaf.edu/
American Indian & Alaska Native Education Research http://www.indianeduresearch.net/
Annotated bibliography on Indigenous education issues - DEST

ANU - Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research - Welcome
http://online.anu.edu.au/caepr/

ATSILIRN Aboriginal & Torres Strait Islander Library & Information Resource Network
http://home.vicnet.net.au/~atsilirn/

Aussie Educator - Australian primary, secondary, tertiary education and teaching resources

Australian Indigenous Research Network - The University of Newcastle, Australia

Best practice & benchmarking in Aboriginal community controlled adult education

Bill's Aboriginal Links http://www.bloorstreet.com/300block/aborl.htm


CANADA BP-II.20 - Best Practices on Indigenous Knowledge
http://www.unesco.org/most/bpik20-2.htm

Canadian Indigenous and Native Studies Association http://www.cinsa.ca/

Center for World Indigenous Studies http://www.cwis.org/

Coombsweb National Institute for Asia and the Pacific Server

Co-operative Research Centre for Aboriginal Health http://www.crcah.org.au/

Dare To Lead


FIAEP Home Page http://mail.koori.usyd.edu.au/fiaep/

First Nations and Aboriginal - Other Links http://tortoise.oise.utoronto.ca/~first/other.html

First Nations and Aboriginal Journals and Magazines
http://tortoise.oise.utoronto.ca/~first/journals.html

First Nations Development Institute http://www.firstnations.org/

First Nations Partnership Programs in Child and Youth Care http://www.fnpp.org/home.htm

Flinders University Institute of International Education
http://ehlt.flinders.edu.au/education/fuiie/frame.HTM

Indian and Northern Affairs Canada http://www.ainc-inac.gc.ca/index_e.html

Indigenous Education - ACER

Indigenous education boosts women’s health and education prospects – UN

Indigenous Education Publications (DEST)

indigenous.gov.au

Indigenous Online Network (Uni SA) http://www.ion.unisa.edu.au/

Indigenous Peoples Australia - Education http://www.ldb.org/oz_ed.htm


Indigenous Training Site http://www.itis.edu.au/

Journal of American Indian Education - Arizona State University http://jaie.asu.edu/

Menzies School of Health Research
http://www.menzies.edu.au/servlet/page?_pageid=145&_dad=portal30&_schema=PORTAL30
Key search terms

Population

Indigenous / Indigenous people / Aboriginal / Aboriginal student / Aboriginal people / Torres Strait Islander / First Nations / Maori / American Indian / Alaska Natives / Canada Natives / Pacific Islanders / Koori

Intervention

career development / career planning / course design / curriculum development / curriculum design / cultural education / cultural factor / cultural awareness / culturally inclusive / culturally inclusive education / culturally relevant education / tribally controlled education / American Indian education / American Indian studies / appropriate course / cultural obligations / flexible delivery / learning activities / adult education / community education / adult and community education / vocational education / vocational training / adult learning / training program / program implementation / Indigenous education / Aboriginal education / best practice / benchmarking / community controlled adult education / quality teaching / delivery systems / community education / case studies / benefits / effective training programs / planning / design / delivery / support services / practical course delivery / community-based training / tutoring / literacy support / financial support / social support / cultural support / student support services / program effectiveness / program evaluation / delivery systems / critical success factors

Outcomes

Evaluation template

To ensure consistency and maximum value from the review, the following template has been developed for completion by each reviewer. It is based on the Framework for the systematic review of research, *Appropriate design and delivery for Indigenous people in vocational, adult and community education and training*. For your responses please circle or bold the relevant answer(s).

Important notes:

1. For all fields, if you are supplying information that you have inferred from the report, or ascertained from other sources, please make this clear by putting it in square brackets and writing *[inferred by reviewer]* at the end of the comment or code. It is necessary to distinguish between what is explicit in the report and what is implicit, or sourced from elsewhere. You may need to undertake further investigation (eg a phone call to an author) to answer a question. If that is the case it must be recorded.

2. Wherever necessary, put a page reference to indicate where in the report you found the text on which your decision was based. This will help in the discussion with your fellow reviewer and in the final synthesis.

3. In many fields, you are asked to indicate one or more codes that apply to all or part of the study. You are also able to use a text field to write comments about how the codes apply; for example if the study uses several types of methodology in different geographic areas, you can outline exactly which codes apply and how they are related.

**1. About the study you are reviewing**

**Q1** Information needed for this section will be supplied with the studies.

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>ID:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Author(s):</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Title:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>Publication details (place, publisher and date):</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>Source (detail below): Web Hand search Database</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>Details:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. About the reviewer

Q2 Please complete your details below:

2.1 Name(s): 

2.2 Date of review: 

3. About the research, its scope and its findings

Q3.1 Briefly describe the aims and scope of the study, including research questions and any hypotheses set up and tested by the study. Use your own words to paraphrase only if necessary (for example if the study describes its aims differently in several places).

Q3.2 State all the key findings and how they relate to the objectives of the study. Please use a separate paragraph for each finding. Use your own words to paraphrase only if necessary (for example if the study describes its findings differently in several places).

Q3.3a Please describe all the proposed methodologies used for this study. Include details of the sample size, population and coverage (eg 30 in-depth interviews in NSW, 2 focus groups in ACT, and a national telephone survey of 400 Indigenous students)

Q3.3b Please describe any differences between the actual and proposed methods used for this study.
Q3.4 What geographic location(s) does the study cover? Select all that apply and make comments in your own words below if you need to explain different geographic locations applying to different parts of the study. Note: local can apply to a location within a particular state, organisation or industry. Please list the region(s)/state(s)/countries the study covers, and make explanatory notes if necessary.

3.4a Australia (national)  
3.4c Australia (local)  
3.4e International (more than one country, may include Australia)  
3.4b Australia (state)  
3.4d International (one country only, not Australia)  
3.4f Other (specify)

Q3.5 What time-period does the study cover? Make explanatory notes if necessary.

3.5a Month(s) if relevant:  
3.5b Year (including range if relevant):

Q3.6 What Indigenous population(s) is covered in the study? Select all that apply; make explanatory notes if necessary. Please record both the expected sample and the actual sample used, if different, and provide an explanatory note in your comments. If the population from which the sample was drawn is different from the actual sample, please also record that in your comments.

3.6a Aboriginal  
3.6c Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander  
3.6e First Nations (North America)  
3.6b Torres Strait Islander  
3.6d Maori (New Zealand)  
3.6f Other (international)

Q3.7 If there are particular characteristics of the included population that you have not yet recorded (eg. specific age groups, gender, employment status groups, etc), please detail below. Make explanatory notes if necessary. Please record both the expected included population and the actual population covered, if different, and provide an explanatory note in your comments. If the population from which the sample was drawn is different from the actual sample, please also record that in your comments.
### 4. About the VET and ACE learning programs

**Q4.1** Who provided the VET/ACE learning program(s)? Select all that apply; make explanatory notes as necessary. List any other provider(s) and give details.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Provider</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1a</td>
<td>School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1c</td>
<td>Higher education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1e</td>
<td>Private provider</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1g</td>
<td>Other (specify)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1b</td>
<td>TAFE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1d</td>
<td>Adult and community education (ACE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1f</td>
<td>Indigenous controlled provider</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Q4.2** How was the program(s) delivered? Select all that apply; make explanatory notes as necessary. List any other delivery methods/types and give details.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Delivery Method</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.2a</td>
<td>On-the-job training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2c</td>
<td>Apprenticeship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2e</td>
<td>Distance education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2g</td>
<td>In classroom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2i</td>
<td>Block release</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2b</td>
<td>Off-the-job training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2d</td>
<td>Traineeship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2f</td>
<td>Online (e-learning)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2h</td>
<td>Community setting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2j</td>
<td>Other (specify)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Q4.3** Was the VET/ACE program(s) Indigenous-specific or mainstream? Select all that apply; make explanatory notes as necessary.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.3a</td>
<td>Indigenous-specific</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3b</td>
<td>Mainstream/general</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Q4.4** What was the nature of the VET/ACE program(s)? Make explanatory notes as necessary. List any other setting(s) and give details. **NOTE:** Q4.6 is where you should indicate whether the programs are accredited (AQF) or unaccredited (non-AQF).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Nature</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.4a</td>
<td>Formal (structured)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4c</td>
<td>Formal and informal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4b</td>
<td>Informal (includes self-directed, networking, mentoring, coaching)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4d</td>
<td>Other (specify below)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Q4.5 What were the major fields of study for the VET/ACE program(s)? Use ASCED (2 digit level) as set out below. Information about what is included in each of these is included on a separate sheet and is also available at http://www.abs.gov.au/Ausstats/abs%40.nsf/66f306f503e529a5ca25697e0017661f/41ca34c3a2af0c2cca256aaf001fca77fOpenDocument

Select all that apply (if any). Make explanatory notes as necessary.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Field of Study</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.5a</td>
<td>Natural &amp; physical sciences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5c</td>
<td>Engineering &amp; related technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5e</td>
<td>Agriculture, env. &amp; related studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5g</td>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5i</td>
<td>Society &amp; culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5k</td>
<td>Food, hospitality &amp; personal services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5m</td>
<td>Learning skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5o</td>
<td>Employment skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5q</td>
<td>Other mixed field programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5b</td>
<td>Information technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5d</td>
<td>Architecture &amp; building</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5f</td>
<td>Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5h</td>
<td>Management &amp; commerce</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5j</td>
<td>Creative arts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5l</td>
<td>Literacy &amp; numeracy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5n</td>
<td>Social skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5p</td>
<td>Other general education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5r</td>
<td>Subject only (no field of education)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Q4.6 Indicate, if relevant, the level of qualification of the VET/ACE program(s). Select all that apply (if any). Make explanatory notes as necessary.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Qualification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.5a</td>
<td>Non-award course (unaccredited)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5c</td>
<td>Secondary education cert.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5e</td>
<td>Certificate II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5g</td>
<td>Certificate IV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5i</td>
<td>Advanced Diploma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5k</td>
<td>Graduate Diploma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5m</td>
<td>Other (specify below)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5b</td>
<td>AQF Subject only/statement of attainment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5d</td>
<td>Certificate I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5f</td>
<td>Certificate III</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5h</td>
<td>Diploma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5j</td>
<td>Graduate Certificate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5l</td>
<td>Bachelor Degree or higher</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Q4.7 If there are any other features of the VET/ACE program(s) that you have not yet recorded, please detail below, with any necessary explanatory comments.
## 5. About the planning, design, delivery and support services in VET/ACE

### Q5.1 Does the study describe/address the **planning** of VET/ACE learning programs?

1. Yes [ ]
2. No [ ]
3. Not applicable [ ]

If yes, please indicate which aspects of planning are included. Make explanatory notes as necessary. List any other relevant factors from the study and give details.

- 5.1a Training packages
- 5.1b Indigenous participation in decision-making
- 5.1c Funding models
- 5.1d Other (specify)

### Q5.2 Does the study describe/address the **design** of VET/ACE learning programs?

1. Yes [ ]
2. No [ ]
3. Not applicable [ ]

If yes, please indicate which aspects of design are included. Make explanatory notes as necessary. List any other relevant factors from the study and give details.

- 5.2a Culturally inclusive courses
- 5.2b Culturally appropriate courses
- 5.2c Language (e.g., bilingual materials)
- 5.2d Flexible timetabling for cultural/family obligations
- 5.2e Quality course materials
- 5.2f Other (specify)
Q5.3 Does the study describe/address the **delivery** of VET/ACE learning programs?

1 Yes  
2 No  
3 Not applicable

If yes, please indicate which aspects of delivery are included. Make explanatory notes as necessary. List any other relevant factors from the study and give details.

- 5.3a Indigenous teachers/tutors
- 5.3b Quality teaching
- 5.3c Flexible delivery
- 5.3d Learner focussed
- 5.3e Other (specify)

Q5.4 Does the study describe/address educational and other support services for Indigenous students in VET/ACE learning programs?

1 Yes  
2 No  
3 Not applicable

If yes, please indicate which aspects of support are included. Make explanatory notes as necessary. List any other relevant factors from the study and give details.

- 5.4a Indigenous support units
- 5.4b Tutorial assistance
- 5.4c Student support officers
- 5.4d Childcare
- 5.4e Health services
- 5.4f Family/community assistance
- 5.4g Other (specify)
6. About the educational, employment and social outcomes

Q6.1 Does the study identify and/or demonstrate change(s) in educational outcomes as a result of the planning, design or delivery of VET/ACE learning programs?

1 Yes  2 No  3 Not applicable

If yes, please indicate all that describe the change in educational outcomes. Make explanatory notes as necessary. List any other relevant outcomes and give details.

6.1a Course/qualification completion  6.1b Module/subject completion
6.1c Movement to higher level courses in VET  6.1d Movement to other education/training (eg. university)
6.1e Other (specify)

Q6.2 Does the study identify and/or demonstrate change(s) in employment outcomes as a result of the planning, design or delivery of VET/ACE learning programs?

1 Yes  2 No  3 Not applicable

If yes, please indicate all that describe the change in employment outcomes. Make explanatory notes as necessary. List any other relevant outcomes and give details.

6.2a Acquired a job  6.2b Improved employment prospects
6.2c Retained a job/employment duration  6.2d Promotion in existing job
6.2e Other (specify)

Q6.3 Does the study identify and/or demonstrate change(s) in social outcomes as a result of the planning, design or delivery of VET/ACE learning programs?

1 Yes  2 No  3 Not applicable

If yes, please indicate all that describe the change in social outcomes. Make explanatory notes as necessary. List any other relevant outcomes and give details.

6.3a Health  6.3b Family/community development
6.3c Capacity building  6.3d Governance
6.3e Self esteem  6.3f Incarceration
6.3g Other (specify)
Q6.4  If the study identifies and/or demonstrates outcomes other than educational, employment or social outcomes as a result of the VET/ACE learning programs, please describe below.

Please include **negative** as well as positive outcomes.

Q6.5  If there are any other details regarding the outcomes of the VET/ACE learning programs, as described in the study, that you have not yet recorded, please detail below. Make explanatory notes as necessary.
7. About barriers or facilitators to outcomes from VET/ACE learning programs

Q7.1 Does the study identify and/or demonstrate barriers to the effectiveness of the VET/ACE learning programs for Indigenous people to improved outcomes?

1  Yes  2  No  3  Not applicable

If so, please indicate what these barriers are (circle all that apply). Make explanatory notes as necessary. List any other relevant barriers and give details.

7.1a Personal attitude  7.1b Peer attitude  7.1c Health  7.1d Financial circumstances  7.1e Availability of other educational opportunities  7.1f Availability of employment opportunities  7.1g Access to services (educational or other – specify)  7.1h Discrimination  7.1i Prior educational background  7.1j Geographic location  7.1k Existing skills  7.1l Funding of programs  7.1m Other (specify)

Q7.2 Does the study identify and/or demonstrate facilitators to the effectiveness of the VET/ACE learning programs for Indigenous people to improved outcomes?

1  Yes  2  No  3  Not applicable

If so, please indicate what these facilitators are (circle all that apply). Make explanatory notes as necessary. List any other relevant facilitators and give details.

7.2a Personal attitude  7.2b Peer attitude  7.2c Health  7.2d Financial circumstances  7.2e Availability of other educational opportunities  7.2f Availability of employment opportunities  7.2g Access to services (educational or other – specify)  7.2h Prior educational background  7.2i Geographic location  7.2j Existing skills  7.2k Funding of programs  7.2l Other (specify)

Q7.3 If there are any other details regarding barriers or facilitators, as described in the study, that you have not yet recorded, please detail below. Make explanatory notes as necessary.
8. ANY FURTHER COMMENTS ABOUT THE STUDY

Q8 Please feel free to add expert comment on any additional aspect that you believe is relevant to this systematic review, for example about the context of the study or the funding source.

9. ANY OTHER RELEVANT RESEARCH

Q9 Finally, please put details here of any highly relevant research referred to in the study you are reviewing, or that you are otherwise aware of, that you believe should be followed up for the systematic review.
10. EVALUATION SECTION

In this section we are interested in your evaluation of this study. Please refer to the Reviewers' Guidelines for Quality Appraisal for explanatory detail.

WEIGHT OF EVIDENCE A (relevance)

Q10.1 How would you rate the relevance of the particular focus of the study for addressing the question of this review? Consider the population, intervention and outcomes as described in the review framework compared with those covered in this study. Rate each component as well as giving an overall rating.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>In this research study:</th>
<th>Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population i.e. Indigenous</td>
<td>High Medium+ Medium Medium- Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intervention i.e. planning, design and delivery of VET/ACE learning programs</td>
<td>High Medium+ Medium Medium- Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcomes i.e. improved educational, employment and social outcomes</td>
<td>High Medium+ Medium Medium- Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Weight of Evidence A (relevance)</td>
<td>High Medium+ Medium Medium- Low</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please add any comment below:

WEIGHT OF EVIDENCE B (quality)

Q10.2 How would you rate the quality of this study in terms of the trust that can be put into its findings against the questions posed? Please refer to the Reviewers' Guidelines for Quality Appraisal.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>In this research study:</th>
<th>Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Is the evidence valid?</td>
<td>High Medium+ Medium Medium- Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is the evidence reliable?</td>
<td>High Medium+ Medium Medium- Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is the evidence authentic?</td>
<td>High Medium+ Medium Medium- Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is the evidence sufficient?</td>
<td>High Medium+ Medium Medium- Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is the evidence current today?</td>
<td>High Medium+ Medium Medium- Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Weight of Evidence B (quality)</td>
<td>High Medium+ Medium Medium- Low</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please add any comment below:

WEIGHT OF EVIDENCE SUMMARY

Q10.3 Please provide final weights of evidence A and B below:

Weight of evidence A [ ]        Weight of evidence B [ ]
Thank you for completing this evaluation form.